CITY PLAN COMMISSION/ARCHITECTURAL REVIEW BOARD
VIRTUAL ZOOM MEETING
MONDAY, JUNE 15, 2020
17:30 (05:30 PM)

CALL TO ORDER

The meeting was called to order by Chairman Steve Lichtenfeld at 17:30.

ROLL CALL

Chairman Steve Lichtenfeld, City Manager David Gipson, Aldermanic Representative Richard Lintz, Carolyn Gaidis (joined after roll call), George Hettich, and Helen DiFate answered roll call.

Absent: Robert Denlow

ALSO IN ATTENDANCE

Stephanie Karr, City Attorney
Susan M. Istenes, AICP, Planning Director

APPROVAL OF MINUTES

RICHARD LINTZ – MOVE TO APPROVE THE MINUTES WITH MINOR AMENDMENT TO THE TITLE

GEORGE HETTICH AND DAVID GIPSON – SECOND

BOARD UNANIMOUSLY APPROVES JUNE 01, 2020, MEETING MINUTES. 5-0

OLD BUSINESS

8108 KINGSBURY BOULEVARD – SIRE PLAN REVIEW – NEW SINGLE FAMILY RESIDENCE

Director Susan M. Istenes summarizes the following staff report: "**This project was previously considered by the Commission on April 20, 2020 and was tabled at that time.** *In response to the Commission's decision to table the project due to concerns over the height of the first-floor elevation, the first floor was lowered 3.5 feet. This adjustment, along with changes to the structure/basement, resulted in the garage floor at the overhead door being lowered 3.3 feet from the previously submitted plan.*

The elevation adjustments reflected in the latest submittal show the removal of the steps in the front walk, but not the steps to the front porch, thus providing relief from the mounded look that was of concern to the Commission at the April 20 meeting.

These changes have resulted in a steeper driveway (which was discussed at the meeting). The previous submittal had an average driveway slope of 6.8 percent; the revisions result in a driveway slope average of 9.5 percent and a retaining wall which is 40.67 feet longer than the previous submittal. To offset the added impervious coverage of the lengthened wall, the house was modified to reduce the square footage of its footprint.

Additionally, a storm pump was required to be added to the project outside the garage due to the garage floor now being lower than the rear yard. While a storm pump is not unique to this project in Clayton, it is a change to the drainage patterns that will further reduce the runoff to the neighboring property to the rear at 8111 Pershing.

The 6,000 square foot site is located on the south side of Kingsbury Boulevard just west of the intersection of N. Brentwood Boulevard and Kingsbury Boulevard. The property has a zoning designation of R-2 Single Family Dwelling District and is located in the Clayton Gardens Urban Design District. The proposed project consists of the demolition of the existing house and the construction of a new 3,781 square foot (not including basement) single-family residence. The height of the proposed residence is 28 feet $2\frac{1}{8}$ inches as measured from the average existing grade to the mean height of the roof.

The purpose of the site plan review process is to provide a review of the following criteria listed below:

1. *A project's compatibility with its environment and with other land uses and buildings existing in the surrounding area.*
   >> The surrounding properties contain single-family homes. The project meets the setback, height, and impervious coverage requirements of the R-2 Zoning District and the Clayton Gardens Urban Design District.
2. *The location and screening of a project's air-conditioning units and other associated equipment.*
   >> The plans show the HVAC units located at the rear of the house. The units will be screened by 5, 3-gallon evergreen China Hollies.
3. *The location, adequacy and screening for trash.*
   >> Trash will be stored in an approximately 56 square foot trash enclosure located on the south (rear) elevation of the house, underneath the deck. It will be screened with a 5-foot-tall wood fence.

4. *Provisions for storm surface drainage shall be in accordance with the City's design standards. Stormwater drainage shall be connected to a storm sewer whenever one is available as determined by the City.*

Disposal of storm or natural waters both on and off the site shall be provided in such a manner as not to have a detrimental effect on the property of others or the public right-of-way.

Impervious Coverage

>> The Clayton Gardens Urban Design District limits impervious coverage to 40 percent of the total lot area and allows an increase in impervious coverage based on the garage placement. For this project, the allowable impervious coverage may be increased to 50 percent for the inclusion of an at-grade, side entry garage. The existing impervious coverage on site is 58.6 percent. The new plans decrease the impervious coverage to 49.3 percent.

>> Front yard impervious coverage is limited to 30 percent in the Clayton Gardens Urban Design District. The proposed front yard coverage is 27.5 percent.

Stormwater Runoff

>> The existing stormwater runoff, according to the MSD 15-year, 20-minute storm calculation is 0.38 cubic feet per second (CFS). The proposed runoff is 0.36 CFS, which represents a 0.02 CFS decrease. The stormwater plan has been reviewed and deemed acceptable.

5. *The applicant is required to submit a separate landscape plan showing existing trees, trees to be removed and trees to be replaced by canopy cover, species and condition. Such plans must reflect City of Clayton preservation standards.*

>> The proposed landscape plan provides an attractive planting design of trees, shrubs, perennials and groundcover. There are two street trees and 9,263 square feet of existing canopy coverage on site with 6,392 square feet being removed. The replacement requirement is 2,760 square feet and they are proposing to replace a total of 4,500 square feet, which results in a surplus of 1,740 square feet of canopy coverage. The replacement trees exceed the native tree requirement with 43.8 percent native.

6. *The site plan must state that all driveways, sidewalks, curbs and gutters are to be installed in accordance with the standards prescribed by the Public Works Department.*

>> The site plan states that all driveways, sidewalks, curbs and gutters are to be installed in accordance with the standards prescribed by the Public Works Department.

7. *Provision of hookups to public utilities connections shall be installed in accordance with the standards of the Public Works Department. All connections shall be shown on the site plan.*

>> The location of the gas, sewer and water connections from the main to the house are shown underground in the front yard. The electric line connection will run underground along the east side yard. The Public Works Department finds the utilities plan acceptable.

8. *All developments shall provide adequate lighting to assure safety and security. Lighting installations shall not have an adverse impact on traffic safety or on the surrounding area. Light sources shall be shielded and there shall be no spillover onto adjacent properties*

>> Exterior lighting is proposed at all exterior doors and at the garage. All exterior lights will be 75 watts or less.

In considering and acting upon site plans, landscape plans and other applicable plans, the Plan Commission shall take the following objectives into consideration:

1. Creation of a desirable environment.

2. Promotion of a creative approach to the use of land and related physical facilities resulting in better design and development, including aesthetic amenities.
3. Combination and coordination of architectural styles, building forms and building relationships.
4. Preservation and enhancement of desirable site characteristics such as natural topography, vegetation and geologic features and the prevention of soil erosion.
5. Preservation of buildings which are architecturally or historically significant or contribute to the character of the City.
6. Use of design, landscape or architectural features to create a pleasing environment.
7. Inclusion of special features.
8. Elimination of deteriorated structures or incompatible uses through redevelopment or rehabilitation.

The height, setbacks and impervious coverage as proposed are in conformance with the requirements of the R-2 Single Family Dwelling District and the Clayton Gardens Urban Design District. Stormwater will be adequately managed on site and the landscape plan features plantings that are appropriate for the size of the site and character of the neighborhood. Staff is of the opinion that the project meets the criteria for site plan approval and addresses the concerns expressed by the Plan Commission at the April 20 meeting.

STAFF RECOMMENDATION IS APPROVE WITH THE FOLLOWING RECOMMENDATIONS:

1. THE DEVELOPER AND ENGINEER OF RECORD ARE RESPONSIBLE FOR MITIGATING SUMP PUMP DISCHARGE IF A NUISANCE IS CREATED.

TONI KAUFER (TK) – OWNER
ERIC VIETMEIER (EV) – ENGINEER
KEITH SCHROEDER (KS) – ARCHITECT

TK– Addresses the Board and goes over the project and how they were able to lower the front of the home by making the drive steeper.

EV – Explains the changes to the slope of the driveway and how it will be mitigated.

CHAIRMAN LICHTENFELD – Anything else?

NO

CAROLYN GAIDIS – MOTION TO APPROVE WITH STAFF RECOMMENDATIONS.

RICHARD LINTZ – SECOND.

BOARD UNANIMOUSLY VOTES TO APPROVE WITH RECOMMENDATION. 6-0

8108 KINGSBURY BOULEVARD – SIRE PLAN REVIEW – NEW SINGLE FAMILY RESIDENCE

Director Susan M. Istenes summarizes the following staff report: "**This project was previously considered by the Commission on April 20, 2020 and was tabled at that time**. *In order to accommodate the request by the ARB that the first floor of the house not sit so high off the curb elevation, creating a "mounding" of the front*

yard, the house first floor elevation was lowered from 633.35 feet to 629.85 feet. As a result, more retaining wall length (40.67 feet) was created which compromised the pervious/impervious ratio. To offset this, 10 inches was cut off the rear of the house and the total overall depth dimension of the house went from 58 feet to 57 feet 2inches. One foot was removed from the front porch depth, reducing it from 5 feet to 4 feet. Because the house was lowered, the roof pitch was able to be increased, giving the roof line less of a "flat" appearance from surrounding properties and the street.

The 6,000 square foot site is located on the south side of Kingsbury Boulevard just west of the intersection of N. Brentwood Boulevard and Kingsbury Boulevard. The property has a zoning designation of R-2 Single Family Dwelling District and is located in the Clayton Gardens Urban Design District. The proposed project consists of the demolition of the existing house and the construction of a new 3,781 square foot (not including basement) single-family residence. The height of the proposed residence is 28 feet 2 1/8 inches as measured from the average existing grade to the mean height of the roof.

The homes located along Kingsbury Drive are predominately two-story, constructed of brick, with siding as a secondary material. The basic massing of the proposed two-story home is articulated on all sides with windows and doors. The proposed massing and appearance are similar to other newly constructed homes in the area, primarily located on Brentwood Boulevard.

The home to the east (8104 Kingsbury Boulevard) was constructed in 1938 and is +/- 8 feet 2 7/32 inches shorter than the proposed home (as measured from the mid-point of each roof). The existing home to the west (8112 Kingsbury) was constructed in 1940 and is +/- 2 feet 2 ½ inches shorter than the proposed home. As required by Section 410.385 of the Clayton Gardens Urban Design District, to avoid tall, blocky building forms, new structures shall incorporate a transition in height and scale through one of six possible techniques. The applicant elected to plant canopy trees at minimum of 20 feet on center within the side yard to help break up the appearance of the taller structure.

Within the immediate area and surrounding the subject property, existing homes feature a variety of building materials including red brick, painted brick, and siding and stone accent materials. The proposed house features taupe colored brick as the primary building material. Limestone accent banding is proposed, and limestone surrounds are proposed above the front door and windows. Limestone banding is not proposed on either side of the structure, nor is it proposed on the rear elevation. Brick solider will surround the windows and doors on these elevations. Horizontal cement board siding to match the brick will be featured on the east elevation. It will cover the chimney and a cantilevered wall projection, for a secondary material total of 11.6 percent. The proposed roof is clad in black walnut colored fiberglass shingles and black casement windows are proposed. The front and rear elevations have changed slightly since the last design iteration. Steps along the front coach walk have been eliminated and a black iron railing at the 2nd story of the front elevation has been added underneath the center windows. The roof pitch above the center windows has also changed from 12/4 to 12/8 and the house roof pitch also was modified from 12/3.5 to 12/5. Staff believes the proposed design and materials are compatible with the neighborhood character.

An 8-foot-wide exposed aggregate concrete driveway is proposed on the west side of the home that leads to an at grade side entry garage with a carriage style garage door in a cream color. There is a 5-foot-tall wood trash enclosure on the south elevation underneath the proposed deck. There are two air conditioning units located on the south (rear) side of the house which will be screened with 5, evergreen China Hollies. There is an existing 6-foot-high wood privacy fence along portions of the east, west and south property lines (on neighboring properties), that is proposed to remain.

Retaining walls are proposed along the driveway for a length of +/- 88 feet, beginning approximately 13 feet back from the front of the house and extending to the end of the driveway. The wall will vary in height approximately 1-3 feet and will be constructed of a clean split fond du lac stone.

The project as proposed is in conformance with the requirements of the R-2 Single Family Dwelling District, the Clayton Gardens Urban Design District and the Architectural Review Guidelines. Staff is of the opinion that the proposed house is compatible in terms of mass, height, and design with existing nearby houses, provided the height is mitigated as noted above.

STAFF RECOMMENDATION IS APPROVE AS SUBMITTED.

TONI KAUFER (TK) – OWNER
ERIC VIETMEIER (EV) – ENGINEER
KEITH SCHROEDER (KS) – ARCHITECT

SK– Addresses the Board and notes that due to COVID-19 the original color choice may not be available and that they have a second proposed color choice in case they need it.

CHAIRMAN LICHTENFELD – Anything else?

NO

CAROLYN GAIDIS – MOTION TO APPROVE AS SUBMITTED

RICHARD LINTZ – SECOND.

BOARD UNANIMOUSLY VOTES TO APPROVE WITH RECOMMENDATION. 6-0

6309 ALAMO AVENUE – ARCHITECTURAL REVIEW BOARD – EXTERIOR ALTERATION/RENOVATION

Director Susan M. Istenes summarizes the following staff report: "The subject property is located at 6309 Alamo Avenue, on the south side of the street, just west of the City of Clayton's eastern boundary. The proposed project consists of painting the exterior of the 2-story single family home, replacing the windows and front door, and replacing the clay tile roof.

The existing home is constructed of brick, red in color, with a brick entry porch/vestibule, stone banding at the base and concrete steps. The existing front door is white in color with a glass storm door and two sidelights, all white. The existing vinyl windows are white, and the roof is terra cotta clay tile. The house's architectural style, with its red brick and terra cotta clay roof tiles is common throughout the neighborhood.

All existing red brick surface areas will be painted with one of three grey toned samples provided in the application materials (yet to be determined). All existing white trim boards, corbels, and fascia will be repaired, then painted in alabaster white. The existing vinyl windows will be replaced with Quaker Brighton aluminum clad windows with a white finish and will be colonial style, with 6" x 6" colonial grids. The existing storm door will be removed and the

front door unit (including sidelights) will be replaced with a fiberglass door that has a textured coal black aluminum frame and smooth fiberglass on the door and sidelights; all black in color.

The home's existing clay tile roof will be removed and replaced with black premium architectural shingles. According to the applicant, the existing clay tile roof needs costly repairs to ensure a desirable appearance and performance, therefore the roof will be replaced with shingles.

Surrounding properties are mainly constructed with red brick and terra cotta clay tile roofs. Painted brick and different colors of brick are used throughout the neighborhood, but the majority is unpainted red brick. Terra cotta color clay roofs are numerous in the neighborhood, green clay tile and some shingled roofs are also present.

Painting the brick grey, with alabaster white trim is a complimentary color scheme which is relatively subdued. The proposed black door, white windows and black shingle combination is complimentary to the grey brick and will blend into the neighborhood. The black asphalt shingles, the black door with white window frames are a classic contrast. The proposed color changes will be compatible with surrounding properties and will give the subject structure a more updated and clean appearance.

STAFF RECOMMENDATION IS APPROVE AS SUBMITTED.

DAN SPEIGEL (DS) – APPLICANT
KARY SPIEGEL (KS) – APPLICANT

DK – Addressed Board and goes over the changes.

CHAIRMAN LICHTENFELD – Asks why the black shingle over replacing the existing.

KS – The black is more complementary to the brick color and is less expensive.

CHAIRMAN LICHTENFELD – Anything else?

NO

CAROLYN GAIDIS – MOTION TO APPROVE AS SUBMITTED

RICHARD LINTZ – SECOND.

BOARD UNANIMOUSLY VOTES TO APPROVE WITH RECOMMENDATION. 6-0

HAVING NO FURTHER BUSINESS BEFORE THE COMMISSION, THE MEETING WAS ADJOURNED AT 18:24.

_____

Recording Secretary